

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY



3 1761 10084240 0

The materials produced herein are intended for the sole use of law students at the University of Toronto.

CASES AND MATERIALS ON FAMILY LAW

Volume 2

Edited by

BERNARD GREEN

LAW LIBRARY

SEP 7 1983

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

The materials produced herein are
intended for the sole use of law
students at the University of
Toronto.

CASES AND MATERIALS ON FAMILY LAW

Volume 2

Edited by

BERNARD GREEN

[1983-84]



Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/casesmaterialson02gree_3

Table of Contents

CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION

I.	<u>The Constitutional Framework: Division of Powers and Charter of Rights</u>	2
	Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms	3
	U.S. Bill of Rights	4
	Note on Impact of Charter of Rights on Family Law	4
II.	<u>The Legislative Framework</u>	7
III.	<u>The Institutional Framework</u>	7
	A. The Courts	7
	B. Other Agencies	8
	C. The Lawyer	8
	Reisman, "Beyond the Call of Obvious Duty"	8
	Mnookin & Kornhauser, "Bargaining in the Shadow of the Law: The Case of Divorce"	11
IV.	<u>Some Views on the Family and Marriage</u>	14
	Eckelaar, <u>Family Law and Social Policy</u>	14
	Sage, "Dissolution of the Family under Swedish Law"	22
	Ryan, "Maintenance Obligations in a New Legal Concept of Marriage"	24
	Posner, <u>Economic Analysis of the Law</u>	28

CHAPTER TWO: FORMATION OF THE FAMILY UNIT AND ANNULMENT

I.	<u>Introduction</u>	33
II.	<u>The Constitutional Issue</u>	34
	Bushnell, "Family Law and the Constitution"	34
III.	<u>The Statutory Conditions</u>	35
	A. Licence and formalities	35
	Marriage Act	35
	B. Effect of failure to comply with statutory conditions	39
	Marriage Act	39
	Friend, "Common Law Marriage in Ontario"	40
	Alspector	40
	Friend, "Common Law Marriage in Ontario".....	46
	C. Age and parental consent	48
	Marriage Act	49
	Re Fox	50

IV. <u>The Conditions Imposed by the Common Law</u>	52
A. Introduction	52
B. A man and a woman	52
C. Who are free to marry	53
Marriage Act	54
D. Who consent to marry each other	57
(1) Mental Capacity	57
Marriage Act	57
<u>Meilen v. Anderson</u>	57
<u>Chertkow v. Feinstein</u>	58
<u>Whitaker v. McNeilly</u>	61
<u>Webb</u>	63
<u>Re McGill</u>	63
(2) Mistake as to the nature of the ceremony	66
<u>Jawani</u>	66
(3) Mental reservations	68
<u>Gardner</u>	68
<u>Iantsis</u>	70
(4) Duress	71
<u>Thompson</u>	71
<u>Truong (Malia)</u>	76
(5) Fraud	77
<u>Moss</u>	77
<u>H. v. C.</u>	78
E. And who are able to consummate the marriage	80
(1) What constitutes consummation	80
<u>Baxter</u>	80
<u>Wilkinson</u>	80
(2) Inability to consummate	81
(a) Physical	81
<u>Foster</u>	81
(b) Invincible repugnance	83
<u>Heil</u>	83
<u>Greenlees</u>	86

<u>Gajamugan</u>	88
<u>Poisy</u>	88
V. <u>Defences to a Nullity Action: Approbation or Insincerity</u>	91
Hahlo, <u>Nullity of Marriage in Canada</u>	91
A. Knowledge	93
<u>G. v. G.</u>	93
<u>B. v. B.</u>	96
B. <u>Conduct</u>	97
<u>R.E.L.</u>	97
<u>W. v. W.</u>	101
C. Delay and improper motive	105
<u>Clifford</u>	105
<u>Norman</u>	107
D. The effect of petitioner's own impotence	109
<u>Pettit</u>	109
IV. <u>The Nullity Decree</u>	112
A. Jurisdiction and other matters	112
B. Conflicts problems	112
C. Economic consequences	112
D. Children	112
 <u>CHAPTER THREE: DIVORCE</u>	
I. <u>Grounds</u>	113
A. General	113
Green, "The Divorce Act of 1968"	114
Divorce Act	114
B. Immediate relief: the fault grounds	116
(1) Adultery	116
(a) What it is	116
<u>Orford</u>	116
<u>Dennis</u>	119
(b) Proving adultery	121

(i)	Standard of proof	121
(ii)	Methods	121
1.	Physical condition	121
2.	Circumstances	121
	<u>Little</u>	122
3.	Admissions	127
	Divorce Act	127
	Evidence Act	128
	<u>Ewasiuk</u>	129
	<u>Veysey</u>	130
4.	Other decrees	131
	<u>Coles</u>	
(2)	Other sexual misconduct	133
	Divorce Act	133
	<u>G. v. G.</u>	134
	<u>Guy</u>	136
	<u>T. v. T. and W.</u>	137
(3)	Cruelty	139
	Divorce Act	141
	(a) Relevance of the common law alimony standard	141
	<u>N. v. N.</u>	141
	(b) Grave and weighty conduct	147
	<u>Knoll</u>	147
	<u>Feldman</u>	148
	<u>Wittstock</u>	150
	<u>Luther</u>	154
	<u>Shumila</u>	156
	<u>Hattie</u>	160
	<u>Elbaz</u>	161
	<u>Rishel</u>	163
	(c) The relevance of intention	164
	<u>Williams</u>	164
	<u>Anderson</u>	170
	(d) The time problem	173
C.	Delayed relief: marital breakdown	173
	Divorce Act	173

(1)	Imprisonment	174
(2)	Addiction	174
(3)	Disappearance	175
(4)	Non-consummation	175
	<u>Chirayath</u>	175
(5)	Living separate and apart in the absence of other grounds	177
(a)	"Separate and apart"	178
	<u>J.B. v. A.W.B.</u>	178
	<u>Deslippe</u>	182
	<u>Boechler</u>	183
	<u>Lachman</u>	184
(b)	Desertion	188
(i)	Without just cause	188
	<u>Sullivan</u>	188
	<u>G. v. G.</u>	192
	<u>Bird</u>	194
	<u>Slon</u>	197
(ii)	...And with the intention to remain apart permanently	198
	<u>Lilley</u>	199
(iii)	The problem of mutual desertion	201
	<u>Price</u>	201
(iv)	Termination of desertion	203
	<u>Digiacinto</u>	203
	<u>Richards</u>	204
	<u>March</u>	207
D.	Proposals for reform	208
	Goldstein & Gitter, "On Abolition of Grounds for Divorce"	208

11. <u>Bars and Defences</u>	213
A. The possibility of reconciliation	213
Divorce Act	213
Irving & Irving, "Conciliation Counselling In Divorce Litigation"	214
B. Absolute bars applicable to all grounds	217
(1) Collusion	217
Divorce Act	217
Sopinka, "The Divorce Act 1968, Collusion Confined"	218
<u>Gillett</u>	223
(2) Fraud	224
<u>Fromovitz</u>	224
C. Discretionary Bars	228
(1) Connivance	228
Divorce Act	228
Report of the Special Joint Committee on Divorce	228
<u>Berger</u>	229
(a) Consent	231
<u>T. v. T.</u>	231
(b) The problem of investigation	233
<u>Pearl</u>	233
<u>Ilechter</u>	235
(c) Termination of connivance	240
<u>Godfrey</u>	240
(2) Condonation	243
(a) Introduction	243
Divorce Act	244
(b) The common law	245
Knowledge, forgiveness and re-instatement	245

	<u>Leaderhouse</u>	246
	<u>Aucoin</u>	252
(c)	The effect of the Divorce Act	254
	Divorce Act	254
	<u>Boivert v. Marineau</u>	255
	<u>Nolan</u>	259
	<u>Ross</u>	259
	<u>Blackburn</u>	260
	<u>Brown</u>	261
	<u>Blue</u>	263
(3)	The exercise of discretion	265
	Divorce Act	265
	<u>Blunt</u>	265
D.	Special bars applicable only to s. 4 grounds	266
	Divorce Act	266
	<u>Raggett</u>	267
	<u>Savage</u>	269
E.	The problem of insanity	270
	<u>B. v. B.</u>	270
III.	<u>Nature and Consequences of Divorce</u>	272
A.	Jurisdiction	272
	Divorce Act	272
B.	Recognition	274
	Divorce Act	274
C.	Consequences	274
(1)	Status	274
	Divorce Act	274
	<u>Baia</u>	275
	<u>Rivera v. Barahona</u>	276
(2)	Economic	278
(3)	Children	278
(4)	Costs	278
	<u>Bregman</u>	278
	<u>Andrews</u>	281

CHAPTER FOUR: ECONOMIC RELATIONS BETWEEN "SPOUSES"

I. <u>Introduction</u>	284
II. <u>Ownership of Property</u>	286
A. Introduction	286
Law Reform Commission of Canada, <u>Family Property</u>	286
Zuijdwijk, <u>A Note on the Standard Property Regime</u> <u>in Quebec</u>	299
B. The law prior to the F.L.R. Act; the law after: the use of trusts	304
<u>Murdoch</u>	305
<u>Rathwell</u>	313
<u>Pettkus v. Becker</u>	314
<u>Marvin</u>	324
C. The F.L.R. Act	325
(1) Provisions applicable to determining ownership of all types of assets	325
(a) Standing	325
(b) Trusts and presumptions of trust	326
(c) Private agreements: domestic contract	327
(2) Family assets and division of family and non-family assets	327
(a) What is a family asset?	328
(b) Powers of the court in dividing property	329
(i) General	329
(ii) In relation to family assets	330
(iii) In relation to non-family assets	331
D. The case law	332
(1) What is a family asset?	332
<u>Bregman</u>	332
<u>Re Leatherdale</u>	336
<u>Ling</u>	337
(2) When will the court make an unequal division of family assets?	338
(a) The effect of gifts	338

<u>Silverstein</u>	338
<u>Bregman</u>	342
<u>Weir</u>	343
<u>Ling</u>	344
<u>Piskor</u>	345
(b) Equal division inequitable in the circumstances	346
<u>Weir</u>	346
(3) When will the court make a division of non-family assets?	348
(a) The impact of s. 4	348
<u>Silverstein</u>	349
<u>Bregman</u>	350
<u>Re Young</u>	352
<u>Collville-Reeves</u>	353
<u>Leatherdale</u>	355
(b) The impact of s. 8	358
<u>Silverstein</u>	358
<u>Re Young</u>	359
<u>Leatherdale</u>	360
<u>Van de Mark v. Walton</u>	363
<u>Kiss v. Palachik</u>	364
(4) The problem of agreements between the parties	365
Family Law Reform Act	366
(a) Agreements not in compliance with s.54	367
<u>Seibt</u>	367
<u>Burton</u>	368
<u>Miller</u>	369
(b) Agreements that are formally valid by s. 54	371
<u>Deroon</u>	371
<u>Couzens</u>	372
<u>Mirus</u>	373
<u>Lamers</u>	374
III. <u>Mutual Duty of Maintenance</u>	375
A. While Married or Cohabiting	375
(1) The law prior to the F.L.R. Act of 1978	375
(2) The Family Law Reform Act of 1978	376
B. On Breakup of Marriage or Cohabitation	376
(1) Who can claim: the problem of "common law" spouses	376

Family Law Reform Act	376
Re Stoikiewicz and Filas	377
<u>Warwick v. Ministry of Community &</u> <u>Social Services</u>	379
<u>Sanderson v. Russell</u>	381
(2) When can claim be made?	382
(a) Nullity	382
(b) Divorce	383
Divorce Act	383
The Interaction of the Divorce Act and the F.L.R. Act	384
Note on the Powers of the Divorce Court	384
(c) On death of one of the parties	386
Succession Law Reform Act	386
(3) What types of order can be made	387
(a) Non-monetary	387
The special problem of possessory rights in the matrimonial home	388
(i) Definition of matrimonial home	388
(ii) Protection accorded a spouse in the matrimonial home	389
(iii) Powers of court to alter occupancy rights	389
<u>Janssen</u>	390
Partition Act	392
(b) Money Awards : Types	393
(i) Periodic payment orders	393
Family Law Reform Act	393
Divorce Act	393
(ii) Lump sum	394
(iii) Secured	394
Family Law Reform Act	394
Divorce Act	394

(4)	Factors affecting monetary awards	395
(a)	Introduction	395
	Law Reform Commission of Canada, Maintenance or Divorce	395
	Family Law Reform Act	401
	Divorce Act	403
(b)	When will a court order that a lump sum be paid	403
	<u>Murdoch</u>	403
	<u>Shaffran</u>	405
	<u>Feldman</u>	407
	<u>Chaffery</u>	408
	<u>Brett</u>	408
(c)	Factors (Other than conduct) affecting quantum of award	411
	<u>Davis</u>	411
	<u>Williams</u>	414
	<u>Barnard</u>	416
	<u>Silverstein</u>	417
	<u>D. v. D.</u>	421
	<u>Cohen</u>	422
	<u>Elasoff</u>	424
	<u>Cure</u>	426
(d)	The significance of Conduct	427
(i)	Under the F.L.R. Act	427
	<u>West</u>	427
	<u>McCabe</u>	429
	<u>Rocha</u>	431
	<u>C. v. C. (No. 2)</u>	432
(ii)	Under the Divorce Act	433
	<u>Murdoch</u>	433
(5)	Variation of awards	435
	Family Law Reform Act	435
	Divorce Act	435
	<u>Harrington</u>	436
	<u>Johnstone</u>	438
	<u>McQuilkin v. Dawson</u>	441
	<u>Neal</u>	443
	<u>Jancov</u>	445
	<u>Gergely</u>	447
	<u>Gigantes</u>	449

C. Special Problems: Contracting Out, Welfare and Problems of Federalism	450
(1) Contracting out of maintenance	450
(a) While parties are alive	450
(i) During cohabitation or upon separation	450
Family Law Reform	450
<u>Mance</u>	451
(ii) Where marital status is terminated by divorce	453
<u>Newman</u>	453
Note on separation agreements	460
(b) Contracting out of claims against a spouse's estate	460
Family Law Reform Act	460
Succession Law Reform Act	460
(2) Welfare	
General Welfare Assistance Act	461
Annual Report, Ministry of Community and Social Services for the Fiscal Year Ending March 31, 1982	464
Family Benefits Act	465
Annual Report, Ministry of Community and Social Services for the Fiscal Year Ending March 1982	469
Annual Report, Ministry of Community and Social Services for the Fiscal Year Ending March, 1981	470
Diamond, "Philosophy of Welfare"	471
(3) Problems of federalism	476
<u>Sniderman</u>	477

CHAPTER FIVE: CHILDREN

I. <u>Introduction</u>	479
Children's Law Reform Act	480
Family Law Reform Act	481
Succession Law Reform Act	481
Divorce Act	482

II. Proving and Disproving Parenthood	482
Children's Law Reform Act	482
<u>Re H and H</u>	486
<u>Re Rhan</u>	490
<u>Ministry of Community and Social Services</u> <u>and Tolls</u>	494
III. <u>The Right (or Privilege) to Raise or See One's Children:</u> <u>Guardianship, Custody, Care and Control, Access</u>	496
A. Introduction	496
B. Private Disputes	497
(1) Custody	497
(a) Legislative framework	497
Children's Law Reform Act	497
Divorce Act	504
Matrimonial Causes Act	505
(b) The general principles: what the academics have said	507
Foster and Freed, "Child Custody"	507
Katkin, Bullington and Levine, "Above and beyond the Best Interests of the Child"	512
Mnookin, "Child-Custody Adjudication: Judicial Functions in the Face of Indeterminacy"	519
(c) Powers of the court	544
(i) Who has standing to apply for custody	544
<u>Smith v. Sears</u>	545
(ii) Award to a person not a party to the action	547
<u>Re Fulford and Townshend</u>	547
(iii) Joint custody order	549
<u>Kruger</u>	549
<u>Fontaine</u>	558
<u>Zwicker v. Morine</u>	559
<u>Field</u>	560

(iv)	The effect of an agreement between the parties	563
	Children's Law Reform Act	563
	Family Law Reform Act	564
	<u>Colter</u>	565
(d)	Interim custody	565
	Children's Law Reform Act	565
	Divorce Act	566
	<u>Papp</u>	566
(e)	Permanent custody	568
	(i) The impact of conduct	568
	Divorce Act	568
	Children's Law Reform Act	569
	Note on "Kidnapping"	569
	<u>Cooney</u>	570
	<u>Bezaire</u>	574
	(ii) Race	578
	<u>Hayre</u>	578
	<u>Singh</u>	580
	(iii) Tender years and plans	581
	<u>MacDonald</u>	581
	<u>Talsky</u>	583
	<u>Mireault</u>	588
	<u>Wakaluk</u>	590
	<u>Romeyko</u>	595
	<u>Bayda</u> , "Procedure in Child Custody Adjudication	597
(f)	Custody after death of natural guardian	602
	Children's Law Reform Act	602
(2)	Disputes between parents and third parties	603
	<u>Hepton v. Maat</u>	603
	<u>J. v. C.</u>	605
	<u>Re Moores and Feldstein</u>	610
	<u>Delvenne v. Nabbie</u>	618
(3)	Access	621
	Children's Law Reform Act	621
	<u>Ader</u>	623
	<u>Boileau</u>	628
	<u>Adoption of a Child by M</u>	630

C. Disputes involving the state or a coercive agency	633
(1) State intervention: the "pure welfare" approach	633
Manson, "The Ontario Child Welfare Act of 1965"	633
Child Welfare Act	639
(a) General	639
(b) Jurisdiction	640
(c) Process	644
(d) Powers on making a finding	649
(e) Accountability: review and appeals	651
Richardson, Unpublished paper	657
Ministry of Community and Social Services, 50th Annual Report	663
<u>Re C.C.A.S. and Pamela M.</u>	665
<u>Re Brady Infants</u>	675
<u>C.A.S. of Winnipeg v. Molyneux and Porteous</u>	677
<u>Tom v. Winnipeg C.A.S.</u>	682
Note, "The Custody Question and Child Neglect Hearings"	684
<u>Re Cordes - Saathoff et al and C.C.A.S. of Metro Toronto</u>	691
(2) State intervention: the quasi-welfare approach	694
Juvenile Delinquents Act	694
Young Offenders Act	698
IV. Adoption	712
A. The statutory scheme	712
Child Welfare Act	712
Ministry of Community and Social Services, 48th Annual Report	727
B. Consent of natural parents	728
<u>O'Connor v. A. & B</u>	728
<u>Director of Man. Child Welfare v. Y.</u>	730
<u>L and L v. Legal Aid 2 Manitoba</u>	733
<u>Re Windsor</u>	733
<u>Re Sobering et al and Sergeant</u>	737

C. The religious factor	739
Petch, "Re Lamb: Religious considerations in Ontario Adoptions"	739
<u>Re Lee</u>	742
D. The search for natural parents or child	744
Child Welfare Act	744
<u>Ferguson v. Director of Child Welfare</u>	746
E. Access	756
<u>C.G.W. v. M.J. et al</u>	756
<u>Williams v. Hillier and Hillier</u>	760
V. <u>The Parental-Child Relationship</u>	766
A. Parental Control	766
<u>Re D.</u>	767
B. Economic Relations	770
(1) Parental obligations to child	770
(a) General	770
Ontario Law Reform Commission, "Report on the Age of Majority"	770
(b) Legislative framework	773
Family Law Reform Act	773
Child Welfare Act	777
Divorce Act	778
(c) The work of the courts	779
<u>Waters v. Nicholls</u>	779
<u>Re Dolabaille and Carrington</u>	781
<u>Clark</u>	784
<u>Janzen</u>	786
<u>Harrington</u>	788
<u>Gartner</u>	790
<u>Hock</u>	792
<u>Walls v. Hanson</u>	794
(d) The effect of death	795
Succession Law Reform Act	795
<u>Re Pfrimmer</u>	802

(2) The child's duty to maintain his parents.....	803
---	-----

Family Law Reform Act	803
-----------------------------	-----

Succession Law Reform Act	805
---------------------------------	-----

CHAPTER SIX: PROTECTION OF THE FAMILY UNIT
AGAINST INTERFERENCE BY THIRD PARTIES

I. <u>Between Husband and Wife</u>	808
--	-----

Ontario Law Reform Commission Report on Family Law, Part I: Torts	808
--	-----

Kelly; "The Case for Retention of Causes of Action for Intentional Interference with the Marital Relationship"	814
--	-----

Leaphart and McCann, "Consortium: An Action for the Wife"	818
--	-----

Ontario Law Reform Commission Report on Family Law, Part I: Torts	824
--	-----

Family Law Reform Act	827
-----------------------------	-----

II. <u>Between Parent and Child</u>	827
---	-----

Ontario Law Reform Commission Report on Family Law, Part I: Torts	827
--	-----

Family Law Reform Act	830
-----------------------------	-----

CHAPTER FIVE: CHILDREN



"If not for me, you wouldn't exist!"

NEW YORKER 8 May 1971 - p. 80

I Introduction

The common law drew a distinction between those children born in lawful wedlock and those born outside wedlock. The latter--the illegitimate--suffered various disabilities and their parents' rights to custody were also affected by their status. In the 1960's Ontario partially reformed this area of the law: see Green & Winters, *The Ontario Legitimacy Act* (1965), 16 U. of T. L.J. 194. The final legal reform came with the Children's Law Reform Act which abolishes the legal disabilities of children born outside lawful wedlock.